An Exercise in Improving Suicide Reporting in Print Media

Konrad Michel, Conrad Frey, Kathrin Wyss, Ladislav Valach

This study was conducted to support the publication of guidelines for media reporting on suicide. First, quantitative and qualitative aspects of suicide reporting in Swiss print media were surveyed over a time span of 8 months. The results were presented at a national press conference, and written guidelines for suicide reporting were sent out to all newspaper editors. The results of the survey and the guidelines were discussed in a personal meeting with the Editor-in-Chief of the main tabloid. After the publication of the guidelines a second, identical survey was conducted. The main variables regarding frequency, form, and content of the newspaper reports before and after the press conference were compared. The number of articles, on the one hand, increased over the 3 years between the first and second survey, but the quality of reporting clearly improved on the other. The personal contact with the editor of the tabloid was probably the most effective means of intervention.

Keywords: Suicide, prevention, media.

Media reporting about suicide is a public health issue. Numerous studies have demonstrated a relationship between suicide reporting or fiction and subsequent self-injurious behavior [for an overview, see Schmidtke & Schaller, 1998]. Early studies reporting an increase of suicides due to newspaper reports about suicide were those by Motto [1970], Blumenthal and Berger [1973], and Phillips [1974]. The relationship between nonfictional suicide stories and suicidal behavior was further supported by Jonas [1992], Wasserman [1992], and Stack [1988, 1996]. The fact that some investigators found contradictory evidence [e.g., Kessler et al., 1988; Littmann, 1985] raises the question of which reports cause additional suicides and which do not. Of special interest are some reports that give insight into the possible mechanisms involved. For instance, Fekete and Macsai in Hungary [1990] reported a dramatic increase of suicides with lidocain after the widely published suicide of a beauty-queen with this drug. The effect was most pronounced among females ages 15 to 39, i.e., among those individuals considered most similar to the model with respect to age and gender. The authors assumed that giving the exact details of the method used and the romanticizing of this suicide were among the possible reasons for the contagious effect of the reporting. In Vienna, Sonneck et al. [1990] showed that after newspaper editors were contacted and provided with guidelines for reporting on suicide, the number of suicides in the Viennese Metro dropped by more than 70% and remained low during the following
years [see also Etzersdorfer et al., 1992; Sonneck et al., 1994]. The suicide of Kurt Cobain, which was widely covered by the media, was another recent “natural experiment,” where the reporting in both print and visual media was considered responsible and where no “Werther effect” was subsequently observed [Jobes et al., 1996]. It is likely that in this case the active role of the Seattle Crisis Clinic in advising journalists had a considerable influence on the reporting. Taken together, these natural experiments clearly suggest that if the quality of suicide reporting can be improved, the risk of contagion will be reduced.

In 1992, the Swiss Medical Association in conjunction with the Swiss Federal Office for Health launched a suicide prevention campaign covering several areas of preventive work [Frey & Michel, 1991]. Switzerland traditionally has a relatively high suicide rate (20/100,000 in 1992), the rate being especially high among young Swiss men aged 15–24 [Lester, 1991; Michaud, 1993]. The working group responsible for the campaign decided that suicide reporting in Swiss newspapers should be critically evaluated and guidelines for media coverage of suicide issued based on this survey. Although Switzerland is a small country with only 7 million inhabitants, an effect similar to the one found by Sonneck et al. could not be expected, a disadvantage being that Switzerland has three different languages and a large number of local newspapers. However, the working group decided that a second survey should be conducted after the publication of the guidelines to monitor the changes in suicide reporting.

Method

First Survey

Over a time span of 8 months all daily, weekly, and monthly papers and magazines published in Switzerland (except for professional publications) in German, French, and Italian were screened by a professional media monitoring agency for words such as “suicide” and “attempted suicide.” Altogether some 400 newspapers and magazines were examined. The collected newspaper clippings were carefully read by the authors and coded for statistical analysis.

For coding purposes, a list of 50 items was designed. The items were derived from the Center for Disease Control (CDC) recommendations for reporting of suicide [1994] and took into account quantitative as well as qualitative aspects of reporting. The recommendations are based on the assumption that the risk of contagion will be higher the more attention an article receives (e.g., report on front page, the word “suicide” appears in the heading, picture(s) of the person or the scene appear, the victim is glorified, etc.), the more specific details on how and where the suicide occurred are given, and the more the suicide is romanticized (see Appendix for the guidelines on suicide reporting). Quantitative aspects included the length of an article and its position in the newspaper, the size and the words in the headline, pictures, etc., as well as the frequency of reporting. Qualitative aspects referred to the contents of the reporting, above all the question of how much an article might serve as a model for susceptible persons and how much weight is given to measures of prevention. Coding criteria were formulated. If a potentially dangerous aspect of reporting was present, the item was given a positive score. Most items were coded as “present” (score = 1) or “not present” (score = 0), some had graded scores. Sum scores for heading, text, and pictures were calculated from the 50 items. A so-called Imitation Risk Score was calculated by simple addition of the sum scores.

Press Conference and Publication of Guidelines

The results of the first investigation [Michel et al., 1995; Frey et al., 1997] were presented in a national press conference organized by the Swiss Medical Association. Guidelines for responsible suicide reporting were issued in three languages, distributed to journalists attending the conference and sent to all the newspaper editors (see Appendix). As a consequence of the press conference, most newspapers reported about the results of the study and the risk of imitation (“Medical Doctors Issue a Warning about the Danger of Sensational Reports on Suicide”). An interview with the authors was shown in the evening news on Swiss national television on the day of the press conference. In addition, the authors met with the Editor-in-Chief of the main Swiss tabloid, who agreed in writing as well as on television that his newspaper would stop reporting on suicides of adolescents and young adults in a
sensational way (oversized heading on first page, explicit picture of method, etc.).

**Second Survey**

Immediately after the press conference, the second analysis of suicide reporting, over a similar time span, was carried out. The results were compared with the first evaluation. It must be pointed out that, because of the lengthy coding procedure (every article had to be read and coded in detail), nearly three years elapsed between the first analysis at the press conference (and thus the second analysis) and the planning of the press conference.

**Reliability of Data Collection**

The media-monitoring office claims an average hit rate of 85% of articles containing a target word. We have no means to determine the actual rate of missed articles in our study, but we assume that missed articles mainly were those where suicide and attempted suicide were not major keywords and therefore more difficult to identify. The suicide reporting in such articles is unlikely to have much impact on the reader.

**Reliability of Rating**

The ratings were done by the C.F. and K.M., later by K.W. In 20 randomly selected articles of the first analysis (9% of the total) the complete rating was done independently by C.F. and K.M. It was not possible to design a blind study protocol, as the identification of the newspapers (especially the tabloid press) from which the articles originated was easily possible. The main tabloid, because of its form and style of writing and presentation, would have been easy to recognize even if the texts had been transcribed. The inter-rater reliability was satisfactory with a kappa of 0.74 ($p < 0.05$). Later, critical articles were analyzed by a conference rating procedure. This was the case in 60 articles.

**Results**

**First Survey**

During the 8 months of monitoring, a total of 74 newspapers and magazines were found to have articles with at least one of the key words. Altogether 208 articles were collected. Over half of the articles appeared in only 10 of the 74 newspapers. In 151 articles suicide or attempted suicide was the main or one of the main topics. These articles were selected for analysis.

Table 1 shows the frequencies of suicide articles and circulation figures of the main newspapers. The two newspapers with the highest numbers of articles are both German-Swiss, followed by two French-Swiss newspapers. The two German-Swiss newspapers most frequently reporting about suicide happen to be the two daily papers with the highest circulation figures, though this is not the case for French-Swiss publications, where the topic is hardly covered by the three largest newspapers. None of the Italian-Swiss papers had frequent coverage.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Newspaper/Monthly</th>
<th>Circulation</th>
<th>No. of articles</th>
<th>% of all articles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Blick (daily)</td>
<td>364,700</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>16.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tages-Anzeiger Zürich (daily)</td>
<td>261,369</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>11.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>La Suisse (daily)</td>
<td>70,032</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>6.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Le Matin (daily)</td>
<td>53,774</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>5.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Die Wochenzeitung (weekly)</td>
<td>18,500</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>4.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corriere del Ticino (daily)</td>
<td>35,225</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L’Impartial (daily)</td>
<td>31,072</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solothurner Zeitung (daily)</td>
<td>45,542</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Der Landbote (daily)</td>
<td>40,775</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Der Schweiz. Beobachter (monthly)</td>
<td>407,669</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Quantitative Aspects of Reporting

The length of the articles varied from 5 to 380 lines, with a median of 55 lines. The longest articles were covering overdoses taken by celebrities. A picture accompanied 59 articles (39%), of which 13 appeared on the front page. The article or the headline appeared on the front page in 22 articles (15%). The main tabloid in the German language alone had 15 articles on the front page. In 74 cases (49%) the headline print was rated as oversized, mainly in cases of shooting and hanging (46 articles).

Qualitative Aspects of Reporting

The headline in 71 of the 151 suicide articles (47%) was considered to be sensational ("eye-catcher"). In 54 cases, the text was considered sensational (36%). In 59 articles (39%) one or more pictures of the victim or the circumstances of the suicide were shown, at least 13 of which (9%) were on the front page. In 20 articles the heading (13%) and in 39 articles the text (26%) was judged as romanticizing the event or glorifying the person, and a high sum score for headline was given in 62 (41%) and for text in 47 (31%) articles. Inappropriate pictures were found in 30 articles (20%).

For the Imitation Risk Score a cut-off score of 6 (maximum = 22) was used, which left 67 articles (44%) in the high imitation risk group. A first spontaneous evaluation of the raters considering each article as harmless or harmful gave an almost identical result, with at least two fifths of the articles carrying the risk of an imitation effect.

Content

In 139 articles details of the person involved were given; 102 thereof (73%) were male and 37 (27%) were female. In 86 cases (62%) the person was a noncelebrity, in 30 cases (22%) an international celebrity, and in 23 cases (16%) a local celebrity. The method used for the suicidal act was mentioned in 104 (75%) of the person-centered articles: shooting (52 cases, 37%) was most frequent, followed by hanging (12 cases, 9%), overdosing (15 cases, 11%), jumping (12 cases, 9%), and gassing (6 cases, 4%). Shooting and jumping were associated with noncelebrity status, overdosing with celebrity status ($\chi^2 = 20.32, df = 4, p < .001$). The age range was from 20 to 80 years, the median being 35 years. Twenty-one persons (24%) were 25 years old or younger. Of these, the majority (91%) were noncelebrities. Most of them shot (53%) or hanged themselves (21%), none overdosed.

Differences Between Newspapers

Considering the uneven distribution of the number of suicide reports in the different papers, we were interested in whether those papers frequently reporting suicides differ from others in their dealing with suicide as

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Comparisons of Articles from Newspapers with Frequent Suicide Reporting (more than 10 Articles) with Those from Papers with Infrequent Suicide Reporting (10 Articles or Less)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Length of article (over 62 lines)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Headline on front page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Picture on front page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Headline large print</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>News character</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Method named</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Method in headline</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shooting as method</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Circumstances described</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Same case more than once</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Differences are all significant at a 5% level ($\chi^2$ test). No significant differences were found for the following variables: Hanging as method, name of person mentioned, number of pictures.

_Crisis, 21/2 (2000)_
We divided the 139 articles into (a) 68 articles from the papers with frequent and (b) 71 articles from papers with less frequent reporting of suicide. The first group of articles came from only four, the second group from 67 papers. Table 2 shows the main differences between the two groups.

The articles in newspapers with frequent suicide reporting are written more often in a sensational (heading: 77%, \( \chi^2 = 38.8, df = 1, p < .0001 \); text: 63%, \( \chi^2 = 35.0, df = 1, p < .0001 \)) and glorifying way (heading: 22%; \( \chi^2 = 5.6, df = 1, p < .02 \); text: 37%; \( \chi^2 = 6.4, df = 1, p < .02 \)) compared with newspapers with infrequent reporting. It is evident that the main tabloid (Blick) has a more prominent and sensational reporting style on suicide than the other newspapers. In addition, the tabloid has more repeated reporting (19% vs 5%; \( p < .05 \)); more often the reports refer to successful suicides than suicide attempts (69% vs 34%; \( p < .001 \)); and the method used for the suicidal act is usually violent, such as shooting (47% vs 14%; \( p < .001 \)).

General remarks about suicide prevention were found in 40 suicide articles (27%), about two thirds of them (\( n = 28 \)) in articles with a background character. The topic of prevention was covered in a more detailed manner only in about one of ten articles (16; 11%). The same picture is true for therapeutic advice (9% general advice; 7% specific advice).

### Second Survey and Comparison

The second analysis was carried out in order to assess the effect of the press conference and the issuing of guidelines for suicide reporting on the actual practice of reporting in Swiss print media. Here, only the main results that are of interest for the comparison of the two evaluation periods are presented.

### Number of Articles

Altogether 468 newspaper clippings were collected from the same 74 newspapers in the second period. This is a fourfold increase from the first period. In the tabloid (Blick) alone there was an increase from 31 to 115 articles (+270%), while in the main nontabloid newspaper (Tages-Anzeiger) the increase was from 13 to 35 (+170%).

### Comparison of 74 newspapers

The percentage of ratings expressing unsuitable aspects of suicide reporting was consistently lower in the
second period. A comparison of the main items is shown in Table 3. The percentage of headlines placed on the front page was lower, and these were rated less often as sensational or glorifying. There were relatively fewer articles with pictures. A smaller proportion of texts was considered sensational or glorifying. Furthermore, the median length of the articles was shorter (51 vs. 32 lines, \( p < .001 \), Mann-Whitney U-test).

**Comparison: Main Tabloid**

In the tabloid the median length of the articles dropped from 60 lines to 20 lines (\( p < .001 \), Mann-Whitney U-test). Table 4 shows the changes in the dangerous items. Whereas 54% of articles had previously been accompanied with pictures, now it was only 8%. The percentage of inadequate pictures dropped from 32 to 2. Whereas 29% of headlines had previously been scored as glorifying, this was now the case in only 6%, and the percentage of articles considered to be highly suggestible dropped from 24 to 6. Generally, it appears that the style of reporting indeed changed dramatically. However, headlines and articles continued to appear on the front page, although less frequently.

**Comparison: Imitation Risk Score**

In the second analysis the median Imitation Risk Score (Figure 1) was significantly lower for the 74 newspapers (\( \chi^2 = 17.82, df = 1, p < .000 \)), as well as for Blick (\( \chi^2 = 8.53, df = 1, p < .005 \)). In the Tages-Anzeiger articles the Imitation Risk Score was slightly higher (n.s.).

![Figure 1. Imitation risk score (median), before and after publication of guidelines, for all 74 newspapers, for Blick, and for Tages-Anzeiger.](image)

**Discussion**

The aim of our study was to improve the quality of suicide reporting in the printed media. Natural experiments such as those described by Sonneck et al. [1990] and Jobes et al. [1996] indicate that improving media reporting on suicide is likely to reduce the risk of the “Werther effect.” However, the communication between suicidologists and media professionals is not easy. Health professionals often consider suicide reporting irresponsible and determined by what might increase attention and circulation of a product. Journalists, on the other hand, usually claim that they have their internal standards of reporting, although in recent years some of them have become more aware of the effect suicide reporting may indeed have [Knickmeyer, 1996]. Therefore, one of the objectives of our survey was to establish a dialog with newspaper editors and thus to achieve at least some improvement in the standards of suicide reporting. It was also clear that, in view of the numerous factors influencing the frequency of suicide, we could not expect to be able to demonstrate any direct effect of the guidelines for suicide reporting on national suicide rates.

Given these objectives, we decided that a large-scale experiment that tries to answer the question whether suicide reporting in Switzerland is one of the causal factors of the high suicide rate was neither possible nor necessary. We therefore chose rather a field study based on an integrated intervention. The results of the first survey were used as a means to gain the attention of media professionals and to launch the guidelines for suicide reporting. This was done in a national press conference, which was followed by a second survey. To our knowledge, thus far no evaluations of the effect of guidelines have been published.

We are aware of a number of methodological limitations regarding the evaluation of suicide reporting before and after the publication of the guidelines. First, for the collection of articles containing keywords, we depended on a professional media monitoring firm. We had no means of establishing the proportion of missed articles and of determining whether the proportions were the same in the first and the second survey. Second, the ratings were not done blindly, one reason being that the size of headings, pictures, etc., had to be rated. Furthermore, we cannot exclude a bias in
people kill themselves is by shooting, though in Switzerland shooting represents no more than 28% of all suicides [BFS, 1992]. Overdoses, it would appear from the newspapers, are the domain of persons with celebrity status and are not taken by young persons, a total contrast to reality, where the highest rates for attempted suicide are in the age group 15 to 34 years [Michel et al., 1991]. The most disturbing finding is that the persons reported to have killed themselves by shooting or hanging are usually young and as it were “average” persons, i.e., persons with whom most young readers can easily identify. Stack’s [1991] differential identification showed that noncelebrity status of the person who committed suicide was of similar importance, and that identification seemed to work upwards and laterally, especially in the young and in the elderly, but not in the middle aged. For young males, he found that the greater the coverage of noncelebrity suicides, the higher the suicide rate. It seems obvious that suicides of public persons and suicides occurring in public places should be reported and may even justify a prominent place in the newspapers. In our view, however, there is no justification for prominent coverage of the suicides of private persons occurring in private places.

Overall, we found that 40% to 45% of all suicide articles must be considered inappropriate, overall or at least in some aspects (e.g., heading), and thus potentially dangerous for imitation effect.

In the second survey, the press-monitoring firm provided many more suicide articles than in the first survey, although the selection criteria for the collection of articles were the same. It is difficult to interpret the fourfold increase, but it is possible that the increase, coming 3 years after the first analysis, truly reflects a higher interest of the media in suicide. This may be related to value changes in the society, but the question remains open if it could be connected to publicity due to the press conference. The increase in the number of articles was not associated with an increase of the actual suicide rate in Switzerland—on the contrary, the rate decreased from 20.7/100,000 in 1991 to 19.6/100,000 in 1994. This may indicate that it is not the number of articles that matters, but the quality of reporting.

The good news, however, is that the quality of the reporting—according to our definitions—has clearly improved, i.e., the percentages of negative aspects of reporting in these newspapers were all lower in the second period of analysis. Articles were significantly

Crisis, 21/2 (2000)
shorter, headlines, pictures, and text were generally less sensational or glorifying. The changes were especially prominent in the main tabloid paper. The sum score (“Imitation Risk Score”) showed the same changes and was consistent with the (independent) suggestability score. The range of the scores was much smaller in the second analysis.

Because there is no way of knowing what the changes in suicide reporting would be without our survey and intervention, it is not possible to claim that the press conference and publication of the guidelines for suicide reporting indeed resulted in an improvement of the quality of reporting. However, in the case of the tabloid paper, the personal meeting with the Editor-in-Chief had a clearly noticeable and immediate effect. This underlines what Sonneck et al. reported in Vienna—that the personal contact between suicidologists and newspaper editors is probably the most effective means of improving the quality of suicide reporting. The same point has been made by O’Carroll [1996] and Knickmeyer [1996].

We believe that large-scale surveys of suicide reporting such as ours are helpful in establishing the communication between suicidologists and media editors. It is evident, however, that we have to gain more experience in how to work together with media professionals to improve the quality of suicide reporting.

Acknowledgments

This study was part of the suicide-prevention program (“Krise und Suizid”) of the Swiss Medical Association and the Swiss Federal Office of Health. The authors thank Mrs. Barbara Weil for her assistance in data analysis.

Appendix


The attention an article receives and thus the risk of contagion will be higher, if

- A sensational placard refers to the suicide.
- The report is on the front page, particularly on the upper half.
- The word “suicide” appears in the heading.
- Picture(s) of the person or the scene appear.
- The victim is glorified, or the act described as heroic or understandable (“... under these circumstances it was obvious that ...”).

The effect on susceptible persons will be larger, the more

- Specific details on how and where the suicide occurred are given.
- The suicide is described as unexplainable (e. g., “He had everything going for him”).
- The reasons for the suicide are romanticized (e. g., “... to be united in eternity”)
- The reasons are simplistic (e. g., “The boy committed suicide because of bad marks at school”).

Note: Articles can encourage the prevention of suicide by pointing out ways to cope with a suicidal crisis.

The risk of contagion will be lower if

- Alternatives to suicide are presented (e. g., where could the person have found help?).
- Examples are given of positive outcomes.
- Information is provided on community resources for people who may be suicidal.
- A list of clues to suicidal behavior is given.

Warning signs

- Direct or indirect suicide threats.
- Previous suicide attempts.
- Changes in behavior (withdrawal, apathy, moodiness).
- Depression (sleeplessness, loss of appetite, hopelessness, worrying, loss of initiative and interests, lack of concentration).
- Possible final arrangements (such as giving away personal belongings).
References

O’Carroll PW. Commentary. Suicide and Life-Threatening Behavior 1997; 26:264–269.

Konrad Michel, MD, PhD, is a clinical psychiatrist at the Psychiatric Outpatient Clinic of the University Hospital, Bern, Switzerland. He also has a private practice in Thun. He is past president of the Schweizerische Gesellschaft für Krisenintervention und Suizidprophylaxe (Swiss Society for Crisis Intervention and Suicide Prevention). He has been active in training general practitioners in suicide prevention and was a member of the working group “Krise und Suizid” (Crisis and Suicide), a suicide-prevention program launched by the Swiss Medical Association and Federal Health Office. Conrad Frey, MD, is a child and adolescent psychiatrist who at the time of the study was head of the Psychosomatic Unit of the University Children’s Hospital in Bern, Switzerland. He was also Chairman of the Prevention Committee of the Swiss Medical Association from 1990–1995. He is now Director of the Swiss Red Cross Therapy Center for Torture Victims in Bern.
Kathrin Wyss, MD, is a pediatrician who now works at the Children's Hospital in Luzern, Switzerland. She did the ratings of the second survey of newspaper articles when she was in training at the University Children’s Hospital of Bern. Ladislav Valach, PhD, was at the time of the study a research psychologist at the Psychiatric Outpatient Clinic of the University Hospital in Bern, Switzerland. He now works as a clinical and research psychologist at the Department of Rehabilitation and Geriatrics of the Bürgerpsital in Solothurn, Switzerland. Most of his publications have been in the field of health psychology, with a special interest in action theory and its practical application. He is a member of the Editorial Board of the Journal of Health Psychology and a committee member of the European Health Psychology Society. Send correspondence to PD Dr. Konrad Michel, Psychiatrische Poliklinik, University Hospital, CH-3010 Bern, Switzerland (tel +41 31 632-8811, fax +41 31 632-8950, E-mail konrad.michel@pupk.unibe.ch).

Crisis, 21/2 (2000)